Conceptual Framework in Retaining Staff for Nursing Homes in Malaysia: Content Analysis based on Expert Interviews

Hasif R. Hasbollah, Nurul A. Abd Aziz, Nur A. Mohd Yaziz, Mohd F. Mohd Nasir, and Siti N. Mohd Rosdi

Abstract—This paper aims to develop a Conceptual Framework in Retaining Staff to improve staff and organizational effectiveness for Nursing Homes in Malaysia. Expert Interviews with five Nursing Homes were conducted via purposive sampling and analyzed by Content Analysis. The results indicate that the framework comprises: (a) people, which are qualified staff and development of attitude, skills, knowledge and performance for the effectiveness of service delivery; (b) programmes which include training and motivation programmes, practical courses, and job rotation as the practices; (c) process, which is the strategy of continuous improvement of people and programmes in the Nursing Homes; (d) funds, are the government financial supports to assist the; and; (e) rewards, are one of the incentives to retain staff services.

Index Terms—Retaining staff, nursing home, content analysis, expert interviews.

I. INTRODUCTION

In this era of globalization, every organization is eager to manage their staff turnover systematically. It is because human capital is the key factors that drive the growing of an organization. Thus, organization’s ability in maintaining and nourishing its human resources will give great results to the organizations itself. Good pay and benefits in an economic are very difficult to an organization in order to meet the basic requirements of offering a safe environment.

Turnover is a cause of concern for healthcare organizations that may lead to implication on the quality of service that provide to the patient. High productivity, fewer turnover and be profitable were every organization wishes [1]. Staff turnover can be referring as the process those employees leaving and organization and need to be replaced. Staff turnover is a large and expensive problem in the long-term care environment. Comparing to the other group of occupational, nurses are tend to leave the profession at a high rate [6]-[8]. It happens because of nursing home nurses are the lowest paid employees in healthcare labor force.

Nursing staff turnover may lead into potential negative health outcome for residents [8]. Furthermore, increasing in deficiencies may occur caused by the characteristics of the resident that making nursing staff to working extra hours [10]. As a result, it can happen when nursing staff payment (salary, wages and other beneficiation) are disproportionate compare to their working hours. Understanding turnover in nursing homes is important because it can influence nursing home facility operation cost, lower nursing staff satisfaction and will resulting negative outcome for residents [11].

Poor services by the nurses tend to lead into potential negative services in NHs [8]. Previous research found that high workloads increased emotional exhaustion among nurses in NHs that contributes to turnover [12]-[14]. Excessive workloads such as high demand work situation and working extra hours cause inferiority care of NHs [10], [15]-[17].

Education heterogeneity also can influence nursing staff turnover [7]. Poor pain management that including sleep disorder, poor nutrition, depression and stress, anxiety, agitation, decreased activity, delayed recuperation, and lower quality of life [18], [19]. Nursing staff must be conversant about pain and their medication to dispel resident and family myth [20]. It is because conflict with residents and their families were significantly associated with emotional and depersonalization [21]. Training is important to nursing staff to overcome job-related stress. It is because they required 75

Manuscript received January 30, 2016; revised April 27, 2016.

H. R. Hasbollah is with the Faculty of Entrepreneurship and Business, University Malaysia Kelantan, Malaysia (e-mail: raﬁdee@umk.edu.my).

N. A. A. Aziz and S. N. M. Rosdi are with the Faculty of Entrepreneurship, University Malaysia Kelantan, Malaysia (e-mail: ashqin.a@umk.edu.my, nablah.mr@umk.edu.my).

N. A. M. Yaziz is with the Business Department, Faculty of Entrepreneurship, University Malaysia Kelantan, Malaysia (e-mail: amirah.m@gmail.com).

M. F. M. Nasir is with the Wellness and Hospitality Unit, Faculty of Entrepreneurship and Business, University Malaysia Kelantan, Malaysia (e-mail: mferdhaus@umk.edu.my).

High staff turnover may result in increasing cost in selection and recruitment. Furthermore, turnover is a large and expensive problem in the long-term care environment that may affect quality of care, patient safety and patient satisfaction [4], [5]. It also affects the organizational productivity as well as the morale and motivation of the remaining staff. Hiring a knowledgeable people for the job is crucial for an organization but retaining the staff are even more important.

A. Issues of Staff Turnover

In healthcare organizations, staff turnover can be a cause of concern as it will give effects on the quality of service provided to patients. Staff turnover can be defined as the process that employees leaving and organization and need to be replaced. Staff turnover is a large and expensive problem in the long-term care environment. Comparing to the other group of occupational, nurses are tend to leave the profession at a high rate [6]-[8]. It happens because of nursing home nurses are the lowest paid employees in healthcare labor force [9].

Nursing staff turnover may lead into potential negative health outcome for residents [8]. Furthermore, increasing in deficiencies may occur caused by the characteristics of the resident that making nursing staff to working extra hours [10]. As a result, it can happen when nursing staff payment (salary, wages and other beneficiation) are disproportionate compare to their working hours. Understanding turnover in nursing homes is important because it can influence nursing home facility operation cost, lower nursing staff satisfaction and will resulting negative outcome for residents [11].

Poor services by the nurses tend to lead into potential negative services in NHs [8]. Previous research found that high workloads increased emotional exhaustion among nurses in NHs that contributes to turnover [12]-[14]. Excessive workloads such as high demand work situation and working extra hours cause inferiority care of NHs [10], [15]-[17].

Education heterogeneity also can influence nursing staff turnover [7]. Poor pain management that including sleep disorder, poor nutrition, depression and stress, anxiety, agitation, decreased activity, delayed recuperation, and lower quality of life [18], [19]. Nursing staff must be conversant about pain and their medication to dispel resident and family myth [20]. It is because conflict with residents and their families were significantly associated with emotional and depersonalization [21]. Training is important to nursing staff to overcome job-related stress. It is because they required 75
hours of entry-level training in orders to train workers properly [9].

Therefore the aim of this research is to develop a Conceptual Framework in Retaining Staff to improve staff and organizational effectiveness for Nursing Homes in Malaysia.

B. Conceptual Framework for Retaining Staff for Nursing Homes in Malaysia

Retaining of skilled employees had been serious concern to any managers in any organization in order to faces the increasing high rate of employee turnover. Business environment had become competitive thus making skilled employees the major differentiating factor for most organization. Retaining staff involves by measure to encouraging employees to stay remain in the organization for maximum period of time [22].

Due to this, the underlying theory for retaining staff is based on Dixon’s Equity-Sensitive Perspective (ESP): A Model for Managing Change [23]. Dixon’s ESP elaborates retaining staff and organizational effectiveness in delivering the services [23]. The ESP’s conversions model that focuses on people, process, and programme in the context of institutional change.

Staff or people play a key role in quality of care in the Nursing Home or NHs [24]. According to Dixon [23], people in organization must foster awareness and acceptance of individual differences, encourage greater understanding of the nature and dynamics of the differences. In ESP, people and stable nursing workforce will ensure the qualities of care received by residents that are vital. Thus, by having sufficient numbers of qualified and skilled nurses enable the development of skills, knowledge, and organizational improvement.

Process of ESP aims to structure continuous improvement of people and programme in any organization. Dixon [23] stated that, all staff in an organization will participate in an on-going process of ESP in achieving particular organization missions. Hence, process in ESP is the effectiveness of improvement in staff and organizational that affects the interpretation of job requirements, relationship between colleagues, and perspectives in the methods of working that leads to satisfaction. Satisfaction is important because it posited as a main component of overall job satisfaction, job performance, and retention of nursing staff [25].

In ESP, programme is one of the factors which is referred to an assortment of terms such as in service, continuing professional staffing and assumes various forms. Programme in ESP is the main concern of employee and organization that tends to achieve the goals for quality services, personal growth, retaining staff, and organizational improvement [26]. Hence, implementing a programme is clearly beneficial by helping to address issues of diversity, assist miscellaneous populations by integrating fully into the organization and by providing staffing opportunities and capacities [23].

II. METHOD

This study is conducted using Expert Interviews (EI) with five Nursing Homes (NHs) via purposive sampling. The data gathered from the Expert Interviews (EI) are analyzed using Content Analysis (CA). CA is a vital and powerful tool in analyzing qualitative research that has a systematic technique and collates valid inferences from texts into fewer categories and themes [27]-[30].

In employing CA, all the interview transcripts from the EI are carefully considered in obtaining sense of the whole data. The respondents’ responses are extracted and brought into one table, which constituted the unit of analysis. The table is divided into “Respondent Identifier”, “Interview Text”, “Interpretation of the Underlying Meaning”, and “Descriptive Codes” (Refer to Appendix A).

“Respondent Identifier” is referred to the five NHs that have participated in study which are coded as “Nursing Home 1 as NH1”; “Nursing Home 2 as NH2”; “Nursing Home 3 as NH3”; “Nursing Home 4 as NH4”; and “Nursing Home 5 as NH5”.

Considering the context of the insights of five NHs will be complex and complicated to understand, therefore the meaning of the “Interview Texts” are condensed into an “Interpretation of the Underlying Meaning” that will be summarized and manifested in the content of the responses. The condensed “Underlying Meaning of the Interpretation” is seen as a whole and abstracted into “Descriptive Codes”. The “Descriptive Codes” are the thread of meaning running through the condensed texts that are encrypted. It will be later used in developing the Framework.

III. RESULTS

This section represents the findings in “Developing Conceptual Framework for Retaining Staff”. As mentioned earlier in the section for method, the responses from the EI are brought together and divided into “Respondent Identifier”, “Interview Text”, “Interpretation of the Underlying Meaning”, and “Descriptive Code” (Appendix A).

In developing the framework for Nursing Homes, Dixon’s Equity-Sensitive Perspective (ESP): A Model for Managing Change is employed, explained, and elaborated for five NHs in order to provide understanding of the research. The respondents provide insights in developing the framework that explain the factors of people, programme and process. In addition, the respondents also provide suggestions such as “government fund” and “rewards incentive” to be included in the SDF. “The government fund” is coded as “funds” and “rewards incentive” is coded as “Rewards”. These two contributing elements are also included in the framework.

The results indicate that the framework is integrated into: (a) people, the development of knowledge and skills of nurses; (b) programme; training programmes for quality services; and (c) process, the structure for continuous improvement in the Nursing Homes. Suggestions such as “funds” and “rewards” with financial incentives from the government are also proposed to be included in the framework.

IV. DISCUSSION

There are various thoughts and views that have been collected during EI in developing the Conceptual Framework in Retaining Staff for Nursing Home in Malaysia. However, expert views and useful insights have been established.
A. People
This study showed the findings that people have been mentioned by all five NHs. Consequently, other study [24] have stressed that people play a key role in quality of care in the NHs. Majority of the respondents reiterated that recruitment of qualified staff is vital for the framework. Furthermore, the respondents stated that developing people’s attitude, skills, and knowledge are also vital for the quality services in the NHs.

B. Programme
The main objective of the framework to enhance the work performance of NH employees through various programmes. The responses of five NHs indicated that teaching, practical training, job rotation, and motivation programmes help the staff to develop positive attitude, skills, knowledge and increases job satisfaction. Hence, various programmes conducted by the NHs help to retain the staff and organizational improvement [10], [26].

C. Process
A process of framework assists the staff continuous improvement in attaining new skills and knowledge and also increasing the quality care of services in the NHs. Therefore, the effectiveness of strategies, structure, and system of process helps to overcome the issues of staff turnover due to workload and lack of organizational supervision [10], [15]-[19].

D. Funds and Rewards
The literature stated that there are external factors of other opportunities that contribute to the nurses’ turnover [31], [32]. Due to this, majority of the NHs suggested that funds and incentives have to be included in the framework. According to the NHs, the government funds can assist the NHs in developing the training programmes for the staff. On the other hand, rewards are fundamental in retaining the staff and as an incentive to job satisfaction. Furthermore, previous scholars [33], [34] asserted that job satisfaction with pay and benefits influence the nurses’ turnover.

V. CONCLUSION
From the discussion above, the study concludes that the framework integrates: (a) people, which are qualified staff, and development of attitude, skills, knowledge (ASK) and performance for the effectiveness of service delivery; (b) programme; which include training and motivation programmes, practical courses, and job rotation as the practices; (c) process, is the strategy of continuous improvement of people and programme in the NHs; (d) funds, are the government financial supports to assist the NHs; and; (e) rewards, are one of the incentives to retain staff services. Fig. 1 summarises the conceptual framework.

APPENDIX A: CONTENT ANALYSIS FOR THE EXPERT INTERVIEWS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondent Identifier</th>
<th>Interview Text</th>
<th>Interpretation of the Underlying Meaning</th>
<th>Descriptive Codes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nursing Home; (NH1)</td>
<td>We understand the model proposed by your team and as for us, we can say that our model is quite similar with your model because we hire the qualified person to be our staff and we continuously provide training for them.Personally, we don’t send our staff to join training programmes outside for example with Ministry of Health, since it is a private organization. We don’t have much finance to support for it. Due to that reason, we do training given by our own management team. For instance, we have training in one room with white board and marker pen. In addition, our nurses work 24 hours. The nurses look after individuals who have health needs. Besides that, our nursing home has qualified and committed nurturing groups in an environment uncommonly familiarises to every resident’s requirements. Each care plan reflects an individual’s strengths, interests and physical and emotional abilities. Moreover, our nurses are concentrate on conveying kindness, to the elderly like taking care of their own loved ones.</td>
<td>NH1 have quite similar model to Dixon ESP Model. Therefore, NH1 provided insights on the framework:</td>
<td>People</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i. People - Hiring qualified staff.</td>
<td>Programme</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii. Programme - Training programmes given by their own management of NH.</td>
<td>Process</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>iii. Process - Focused on the care services that are provided for the elderly.</td>
<td>Fund</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>iv. Fund - Needs funding from the government for the social responsibility for the nation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As for the suggestion, we hope that even though our nursing home is a private body, our mission is one where we support social responsibility programme by the government. Thus, for that reason, we still need more funds for it. Now, we just get funds from the charity and contribution by individuals and private body personally. Therefore, we hope that the government provide concern to us so that our management can be strong in future.
| Nursing Home<sub>5</sub> (NH<sub>5</sub>) | Thank you for explaining to me about the model proposed by your team. If we refer to your explanation, we can say that we only focus to process of working and programme of developing our staff skills and knowledge. Here, I suggest it is better if you can also put reward as one of the element in the development of staff because in this nursing home, we also motivate our staff by giving them an increment of salary, benefits, and bonus to encourage them since you know that it is not easy to manage the old folks.

| Nursing Home<sub>4</sub> (NH<sub>4</sub>) | I am not familiar with academic study but I understand about your explanation about this model. Actually all the factors that are stated by you before this is relevant in terms of enhancing the staff development but how much, I suggest maybe the government can support by providing fund and related nursing programme to all staff and nurses in any private nursing homes in Malaysia that can help us in future.

| Nursing Home<sub>3</sub> (NH<sub>3</sub>) | My suggestion here is, it is better if you can add practical courses in your model such as what we practice in this nursing home. It is evidently, very effective since our establishment. Since we only get three (3) students to take care and handle ten (10) residents here. Thus, it is very important to retain our staff motivation and their skill development.

| Nursing Home<sub>2</sub> (NH<sub>2</sub>) | Since this nursing home is private and independent, really hope that the government at least support and provide financial aid for this nursing home. It will enhance the staff skills and knowledge. Based on the model explained, it is better to give reward or financial incentives so that it is more effective in maintaining and creating good attitude, motivation, and skills for the staff in

| Nursing Home<sub>1</sub> (NH<sub>1</sub>) | Provided insights on:  
1. People  
2. Programme  
3. Process  
4. Rewards

| People | Based on the model explained, it is better to give reward or financial incentives so that it is more effective in maintaining and creating good attitude, motivation, and skills for the staff in

| Programme | Process |
| 1. People | 1. Programme | 1. Process |

| Process Fund Rewards | In addition, it is suggested that the government will also support the private nursing home.

| Acknowledgement | This work was supported by Research Acculturation Grant Scheme (RAGS) from Ministry of Education Malaysia.


particularly in qualitative method.


Hasif R. Hasbollah is a senior lecturer and the head Coordinator of Wellness and Hospitality Unit in The Faculty of Entrepreneurship and Business at University Malaysia Kelantan. He holds a PhD from University of Salford, Manchester in facilities management. He has published several books, including: Introduction to Health Care Industry; Introduction to Nursing Home; and Introduction to Hospitality Facilities Management. His main interests are in healthcare and hospitality facilities particularly in qualitative method.

Nurul A. Abd Aziz is a marketing lecturer in the Faculty of Entrepreneurship at University Malaysia Kelantan. She holds a MBA from University Technology MARA Malaysia.

Nur A Mohd Yaziz is a statistician and lecturer from the Business Department in the Faculty of Entrepreneurship at University Malaysia Kelantan. She holds a master of science in applied statistics from University Technology MARA Malaysia.

Mohd F. Mohd Nasir is a lecturer from Wellness and Hospitality Unit in The Faculty of Entrepreneurship and Business in the Faculty of Entrepreneurship at University Malaysia Kelantan. He is a co-author for Introduction to Health Care Industry and Introduction to Nursing Home. He holds a master degree in sport marketing and facilities from University Malaya.

Siti N. Mohd Rosdi is a lecturer in the Faculty of Entrepreneurship at University Malaysia Kelantan. She holds a degree in finance from University Technology MARA Malaysia and also master degree in international business from University of Tasmania Australia.